



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 5
77 WEST JACKSON BOULEVARD
CHICAGO, IL 60604-3590

MAR 25 2009

REPLY TO THE ATTENTION OF:
LC-8J

CERTIFIED MAIL

Receipt No.7001 0320 0006 0182 9771

Valdemar Fischer
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
P.O. Box 18300
Greensboro, North Carolina 27419

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No. FIFRA-05-2009-0009

Dear Mr. Valdemar:

Enclosed please find a copy of a fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order concerning violations of the Federal Insecticide Fungicide & Rodenticide Act (FIFRA), 7 §§ U.S.C.136 et seq., in resolution of the above case. This document was filed on March 25, 2009, with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

The civil penalty in the amount of \$6,500 is to be paid in the manner described in paragraphs 33 and 34. Please be certain that the number **BD2750945P008** and the docket number are written on both the transmittal letter and on the check. Payment is due by April 24, 2009, (within 30 calendar days of the filing date).

Thank you for your cooperation in resolving this matter.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Claudia Niess".

Claudia Niess

Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section

Enclosures

cc: Marcy Toney, Regional Judicial Officer/C-14J (w/Encl.)
Nidhi K. O'Meara, ORC/C-14J (w/Encl.)
Eric Volck, Cincinnati Finance/MWD (w/Encl.)

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
REGION 5

In the Matter of:)
)
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.)
Greensboro, North Carolina)
Respondent.)
_____)

Docket No. **FIFRA-05-2009-0009**
**Proceeding to Assess a Civil Penalty
Under Section 14(a) of the Federal
Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide
Act, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)**

**Consent Agreement and Final Order
Commencing and Concluding a Proceeding**

RECEIVED

MAR 25 2009

REGIONAL HEARING CLERK
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION AGENCY

1. This is an administrative action commenced and concluded under Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act (FIFRA), 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), and Sections 22.13(b) and 22.18(b)(2) and (3) of the *Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits* (Consolidated Rules) as codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

2. The Complainant is the Director of the Land and Chemicals Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Region 5.

3. Respondent is Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc. (Syngenta), a corporation doing business at 410 Swing Road, Greensboro, North Carolina 27409-2080.

4. Where the parties agree to settle one or more causes of action before the filing of a complaint, the administrative action may be commenced and concluded simultaneously by the issuance of a consent agreement and final order (CAFO). 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b).

5. The parties agree that settling this action without the filing of a complaint or the adjudication of any issue of fact or law is in their interest and in the public interest.

6. Respondent consents to the assessment of the civil penalty specified in this CAFO, and to the terms of this CAFO.

Jurisdiction and Waiver of Right to Hearing

7. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations in this CAFO and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations in this CAFO.

8. Respondent waives its right to request a hearing as provided at 40 C.F.R. § 22.15(c), any right to contest the allegations in this CAFO, and its right to appeal this CAFO.

9. Respondent certifies that it is complying with FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136 to 136y.

Statutory and Regulatory Background

10. The importation of pesticides into the United States is governed by Section 17(c) and (e) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136o(c) and 136o(e), and the regulations promulgated thereunder by the Secretary of the Treasury in consultation with the Administrator of the EPA (the Administrator). These regulations are found at 19 C.F.R. Part 12.

11. 19 C.F.R. § 12.111 states, in pertinent part, that “all imported pesticides are required to be registered under the provisions of Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a, and under the regulations (40 C.F.R. Part 156.10) promulgated thereunder by the Administrator before being permitted entry into the United States.”

12. 19 C.F.R. § 12.112 states, in pertinent part, that “an importer desiring to import pesticides into the United States shall submit to the Administrator a Notice of Arrival of Pesticides or Devices (NOA) (EPA form 3540-1), prior to the arrival of the shipment to the United States.” See also Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136o(c).

13. Section 12(a)(1)(B) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(B), states that it is unlawful for any person in any state to distribute or sell to any person any registered pesticide if any

claims made for it as a part of its distribution or sale substantially differ from any claims made for it as a part of the statement required in connection with its registration under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.

14. Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), defines the term “distribute or sell” to mean “to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, release for shipment, or receive and (having so received) deliver or offer to deliver.”

15. Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t), defines a “pest” as “any insect, rodent, nematode, fungus, weed, or any other form of terrestrial or aquatic plant or animal life or virus, bacteria, or other microorganism (except viruses, bacteria, or other living microorganisms on or in living man or other living animals) which the Administrator declares to be a pest under Section 25(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136 w(c)(1).”

16. Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u), defines a “pesticide” as any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.”

17. Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), defines a “person” as “any individual, partnership, association, corporation, or any organized group of persons whether incorporated or not.”

18. The Administrator of EPA may assess a civil penalty against any registrant who violates any provision of FIFRA of up to \$6,500 for each offense that occurred after March 15, 2004 pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(1), and 40 C.F.R. Part 19.

Factual Allegations and Alleged Violations

19. Respondent is, and was at all times relevant to this Complaint, a corporation and therefore, is a “person” as that term is defined at Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s).

20. On or about January 7, 2009, Barthco International Inc., located at 223 E. City Hall Ave., #208, Norfolk, VA 23510, was a broker/agent for Respondent.

21. On or about January 7, 2009, Respondent submitted a NOA, EPA Form 3540-1, to U.S. Customs and Border Protection for an import shipment of the pesticide product "Pirimiphos-Methyl Technical," EPA Registration Number 1381-171, from Denmark and entering the United States on January 9, 2009.

22. "Pirimiphos-Methyl Technical" is a pesticide product, as defined in Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u), as it is intended to repel or mitigate a pest.

23. On March 15, 2007, the EPA, Office of Pesticide Program, Registration Division issued an "accepted label with comments" for "Pirimiphos-Methyl Technical," EPA Registration Number 1381-171.

24. The NOA identified Respondent as the importer of record for the pesticide product "Pirimiphos-Methyl Technical."

25. Respondent, as the importer of record of pesticide products, and by doing business in the United States, is subject to the requirements of FIFRA and the regulations promulgated there under.

26. The labels on the shipment of "Pirimiphos-Methyl Technical" that entered into the United States on January 9, 2009 at the Norfolk, VA port of entry substantially differed from the March 15, 2007, accepted label as a part of the statement required in connection with its registration under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.

Specific Allegations

Count I

27. The statements provided in paragraphs 1 through 26 are incorporated by reference as though set forth here in full.

28. On or about January 9, 2009, Respondent distributed or sold a registered pesticide with claims on its label that substantially differed from claims made for it as a part of the statement required in connection with its registration under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.

29. This constitutes an unlawful act according to Section 12(a)(1)(B) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(B).

30. Respondent's violation of Section 12(a)(1)(B) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(B), subjects Respondent to the issuance of an Administrative Complaint assessing a civil penalty under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a).

Civil Penalty

31. Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(4), requires the Administrator to consider the size of the business of the person charged, the effect on the person's ability to continue in business, and the gravity of the violation, when assessing an administrative penalty under FIFRA.

32. Based on an evaluation of the facts alleged in this complaint and the factors in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, Complainant calculated an initial civil penalty against Respondent in the amount of \$6,500. Complainant evaluated the facts and circumstances of this case with specific reference to EPA's Enforcement Response Policy for the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, dated July 2, 1990.

33. Within 30 days of the effective date of this CAFO, Respondent must pay a \$6,500 civil penalty for the FIFRA violation. Respondent must pay the penalty by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," to:

U.S. EPA
Fines and Penalties
Cincinnati Finance Center
P.O. Box 979077
St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

34. A transmittal letter stating Respondent's name, complete address, the case title, the case docket number, and the billing document number must accompany the payment.

Respondent must send a copy of the check and transmittal letter to:

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-13J)
U.S. EPA, Region 5
77 West Jackson Blvd.
Chicago, IL 60604

Claudia Niess (LC-8J)
Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section
U.S. EPA, Region 5
77 West Jackson Blvd.
Chicago, IL 60604

Nidhi O'Meara (C-14J)
Office of Regional Counsel
U.S. EPA, Region 5
77 West Jackson Blvd.
Chicago, IL 60604

35. This civil penalty is not deductible for federal tax purposes.

36. If Respondent does not pay the civil penalty timely, EPA may refer the matter to the Attorney General who will recover such amount by action in the appropriate United States district court under Section 14(a)(5) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(5). The validity, amount and appropriateness of the civil penalty are not reviewable in a collection action.

37. Pursuant to 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, Respondent must pay the following on any amount overdue under this CAFO. Interest will accrue on any amount overdue from the date payment was due at a rate established by the Secretary of the Treasury. Respondent must pay a \$15 handling charge each month that any portion of the penalty is more than 30 days past due. In addition, Respondent must pay a 6 percent per year penalty on any principal amount 90 days past due.

General Provisions

38. This CAFO resolves only Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts alleged in the CAFO.

39. This CAFO does not affect the right of the EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law.

40. This CAFO does not affect Respondent's responsibility to comply with FIFRA and other applicable federal, state, and local laws.

41. This CAFO is a "final order" for purposes of EPA's Enforcement Response Policy for FIFRA.

42. The terms of this CAFO bind Respondent, its successors, and assigns.

43. Each person signing this agreement certifies that he or she has the authority to sign for the party whom he or she represents and to bind that party to its terms.

44. Each party agrees to bear its own costs and attorney fees in this action.

45. This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement between the parties.

46. The effective date of this CAFO is the date it is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk, Region 5, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Chicago, Illinois.

In the Matter of:

**Syngenta Crop Protection
Docket No. FIFRA-05-2009-0009**

**RESPONDENT
Syngenta Crop Protection
Greensboro, North Carolina**

RECEIVED

MAR 25 2009

**REGIONAL HEARING CLERK
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION AGENCY**

March 9, 2009
Date

Valdemar I. Fischer *Val*
Valdemar Fischer, President
Syngenta Crop Protection

**COMPLAINANT
Region 5
United States Environmental Protection Agency**

3/19/09
Date

Margaret M. Guerriero *Margaret M. Guerriero*
Margaret M. Guerriero
Director
Land and Chemicals Division

**In the Matter of:
Syngenta Crop Protection
Docket No. FIFRA-05-2009-0009**

RECEIVED
MAR 25 2009

Final Order

**REGIONAL HEARING CLERK
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION AGENCY**

This Consent Agreement and Final Order, as agreed to by the parties, shall become effective immediately upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31. IT IS SO ORDERED.

3/23/09
Date

Walter W. Koralich
for
Bharat Mathur
Acting Regional Administrator
United States Environmental Protection Agency
Region 5

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the original signed copy of the Consent Agreement and Final Order in resolution of the civil administrative action involving Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc., was filed on March 25, 2009, with the Regional Hearing Clerk (E-13J), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 5, 77 West Jackson Boulevard, Chicago, Illinois 60604, and that I mailed by Certified Mail, Receipt No. 7001 0320 0006 0182 9771, a copy of the original to the Respondents:

Valdemar Fischer
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
P.O. Box 18300
Greensboro, North Carolina 27419

and forwarded copies (intra-Agency) to:

Marcy Toney, Regional Judicial Officer, ORC/C-14J
Nidhi K. O'Meara, Counsel for Complainant/C-14J
Eric Volck, Cincinnati Finance/MWD



Frederick Brown
Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section
U.S. EPA - Region 5
77 West Jackson Boulevard
Chicago, Illinois 60604-3590

Docket No. **FIFRA-05-2009-0009**

RECEIVED
MAR 25 2009

REGIONAL HEARING CLERK
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION AGENCY